

## Benefits of Performance Monitoring and Evaluation in Public Service Institutions

Yohannes Worku\* and Mammo Muchie

*Faculty of Management Sciences Tshwane University of Technology  
159 Nana Sita Street, Pretoria 0001, South Africa*

**ABSTRACT:** The overall objective of study was to identify and quantify factors that affect the performance of employees of the City of Tshwane. Studies conducted by Khale (2015) and Marivate (2014) have found that the survival of business enterprises conducting business in and around the City of Tshwane depends upon the quality of municipal services that are provided to business enterprises and the general public by employees of the City of Tshwane. According to Marivate (2014), poor municipal service delivery is one of the root causes of protests over poor quality of municipal services. The study was conducted in order to identify key predictors of performance among employees of the City of Tshwane who are responsible for the provision of routine and essential municipal services. Data was collected from 188 respondents by using a structured questionnaire of study. Factor analysis was used for performing data analysis. The results showed that 64% of employees fulfilled their performance requirements. Results obtained from factor and logit analyses showed that the top three barriers to satisfactory performance by employees were lack of tailor-made and skills based training opportunities, low level of formal education, and lack of job satisfaction.

**KEYWORDS:** *City of Tshwane, Performance monitoring, Skills-based training, Odds ratio*

### I. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO STUDY

The City of Tshwane is home to the seat of the South African Government and Pretoria. The quality of municipal services provided to residents, business enterprises and other stakeholders are known to affect viability in business enterprises. Several researchers have conducted surveys in the past decade with a view to identify obstacles that undermine the quality of municipal services delivered by employees of the City of Tshwane. In this regard, developmental challenges that stifle profitability in start-up enterprises have been reported by Seeletse (2012), Bezuidenhout & Nenungwi (2012), Booysens (2011), Brownson (2014), Marivate (2014), Worku (2015) and Khale (2015). The authors have reported that small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) often fail due to poor or inadequate municipal services, over-regulation, unnecessary bureaucratic procedures, lack of transparency, lack of good governance, lack of efficiency in the administration and management of license applications, inability to assess and evaluate tax, lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of accounting and auditing and bookkeeping skills, inability to draw up business plans, inability to make oral presentations, inability to network with business rivals and competitors, difficulty in securing loans from commercial banks and micro-lending financial institutions and lack of infrastructure.

The study was conducted in order to assess the potential benefits of tailor-made skills based training programmes to improved performance among employees working in the City of Tshwane. The study was conducted by using a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods of data collection and analyses. A review of the literature shows that there is a significant relationship between providing tailor-made skills based training programmes to employees and improved performance to clients and stakeholders. The City of Tshwane (Khale, 2015) has received qualified audit reports from the Auditor-General in the past several years due to factors that are known to affect service quality in local governments and municipalities.

Studies conducted by Khale (2015) and Marivate (2014) have shown that the quality of municipal services provided to customers, ratepayers and newly established small enterprises is a key predictor of sustained growth and economic development. According to Seeletse (2012) and Henrekson (2014), there is a statistically significant association between the perception held by residents about service quality and overall economic growth and development in the major metropolitan cities of South Africa. The study by Horn (2010) has shown that it is impossible to alleviate unemployment and poverty among the urban population without improving the quality of essential municipal services. Shree and Urban (2012) have found that the rate at which small enterprises grow depends upon the quality of municipal services that are provided routinely.

Findings from the study are vital for improving the quality of essential municipal services that are routinely provided to residents, businesses, clients, stakeholders and the general public. The results are vital for developing training and development plans for the City of Tshwane for improving the current quality of municipal service delivery. The study will propose feasible remedial actions for addressing issues such as poor performance and poor service delivery.

### Objectives of study

The research study aims to achieve the following objectives:

- To identify and quantify key predictors of satisfactory municipal service delivery by employees of the City of Tshwane; and
- To assess the degree to which a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation programme could be used for performance monitoring and evaluation;

### Research problem

Studies conducted by Seeletse (2012), Bezuidenhout & Nenungwi (2012), Booysens (2011), Brownson (2014), Marivate (2014), Worku (2015) and Khale (2015) have shown that the quality of essential municipal services provided by employees of the City of Tshwane depends upon socioeconomic factors such as level of education, the provision of skills-based and tailor-made training programmes to employees and the implementation of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation programme to employees. Khale (2015) has reported that small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) often fail due to poor or inadequate municipal services, over-regulation, unnecessary bureaucratic procedures, lack of transparency, lack of good governance, lack of efficiency in the administration and management of license applications, inability to assess and evaluate tax, lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of accounting and auditing and bookkeeping skills, inability to draw up business plans, inability to make oral presentations, inability to network with business rivals and competitors, difficulty in securing loans from commercial banks and micro-lending financial institutions and lack of infrastructure. The study aims to assess the degree to which skills based and tailor-made training programmes are helpful in ensuring satisfactory and efficient service delivery by employees of the City of Tshwane.

## II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The contribution made by small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) to the national economy has been acknowledged by the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2016). According to the report, about 20% of all units exported by South Africa are produced by small and medium-sized enterprises. Although it is generally accepted that growing the SMME sector of the economy is vital for the alleviation of poverty and unemployment, the support provided to the sector since April 1994 has been grossly inadequate (Marivate, 2014). The South African SMME sector is characterized by lack of entrepreneurial skills (Edoho, 2015; Worku, 2014; Seeletse, 2012; Asah, Fatoki & Rungani, 2015), over-regulation (Shree and Urban, 2012), too much bureaucracy (Henrekson, 2014), difficulty in securing loans (Brownson, 2014) and poor municipal services (Khale, 2015).

The annual report issued by the South African Chamber of Commerce and Industry (2016) for the financial year 2014/2015 has confirmed that problems of over-regulation and lack of good governance stifle growth and sustained profitability in start-up enterprises. Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2015) have reported that lack of basic entrepreneurial skills, difficulty in securing loans, cumbersome bureaucracy and corruption hinder profitability in the SMME sector. Edoho (2015) has argued that it is essential to provide tailor-made skills based training opportunities to aspiring entrepreneurs as a means of addressing the critical shortage of business and entrepreneurial skills among black Africans. Reports published by Khale (2015) and Marivate (2014) have shown that poor service delivery by local governments and municipalities as well as lack of adherence to good governance principles stifle sustained development in SMMEs.

According to Henrekson (2014), Ladzani and Netswera (2009), Seeletse (2012), Marivate (2014), Brownson (2014), Shree and Urban (2012), Booysens (2011), Bezuidenhout and Nenungwi (2012), Asah, Fatoki and Rungani (2012), Edoho (2015) and Worku (2014), the task of addressing the underlying causes of failure in start-up enterprises operating in various parts of South Africa requires policy-related intervention. Mafunisa (2004) and Snyman & Vorster (2011) have reported that skills based training programmes are essential for improving service quality standards in areas such as water and lights, road maintenance, finance, tax collection and waste management. According to Phago (2009) and McNamara (2008), the training of employees must be aligned to key performance areas and indicators. Such a goal could only be achieved by assessing the training needs of employees. In this regard, Sanderson (2011) has proposed a guideline that could be used for aligning the training needs of employees with key performance areas. The author has pointed out that performance monitoring and evaluation should be used as a tool for aligning the training needs of employees with key performance areas of employees.

The City of Tshwane is home to a large number of businesses and government departments. The City of Tshwane has been operating as a metropolitan municipality since 2000. It is located in Gauteng Province and includes Pretoria (Breetzke and Horn 2006). In 2008, the municipality merged with Metsweding, Cullinan and Bronkhorstspuit forming the single-largest metropolitan municipality in Southern Africa. It comprises 7 regions, 105 wards, 210 councillors and residents estimated at 2.5 million (Phago 2009; Horn 2010; Snyman and Vorster 2011; Aigbavboa and Thwala 2013). Because of its size and composition, it is classified as Category A Grade 6 Urban Municipality under the Municipal Demarcation Board in terms of Section 4 of Local Government Municipal Structures Act, 1998 (Act 117 of 1998). Its management comprises an executive mayoral system (Phago 2009; Horn 2010; Snyman and Vorster 2011; Aigbavboa and Thwala 2013).

The formation of the new City of Tshwane was consistent with the Gauteng Global City Region Strategy aimed at reducing the number of municipalities in the province and instituting new structures by 2016. In line with the new structures, the Mayoral Executive System combines with a ward participatory system along with Section 2(g) of the Determination of Types of Municipality Act, 2000 (Act 1 of 2000). These change processes were geared towards local government transformation and aimed at enhancing the performance of employees in their positions of providing service delivery (Diedericks and Joubert 2006; Horn 2010). In fact, the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) states that municipalities must structure and manage their administration, budgeting, and planning processes in such a manner as to prioritise the provision of essential needs of communities and promote social and economic development.

The efficient provision of services remains a priority as stated in the municipalities' charter. Yet, municipalities in South Africa are constantly faced with challenges of how best to advance the status quo (Cameron and Sewell 2003; Cameron 2005; De Waal and Gerritsen-Medema 2006; Diedericks and Joubert 2006; Aigbavboa and Thwala 2013). Government and such bodies as South African Local Government Association (SALGA) instituted a number of changes for stepping up the efficient provision of services. Notwithstanding those change processes and prioritisation, municipalities particularly City of Tshwane continue to encounter challenges relating to improving service delivery in their areas of jurisdiction (Nel and Rogerson 2005; Phago 2009). Thus, employees' performance in municipalities is under close scrutiny.

The potential benefits of skills based training opportunities to employees of large municipalities such as the City of Tshwane have been shown in studies conducted by Seeletse (2012), Bezuidenhout & Nenungwi (2012), Booysens (2011), Brownson (2014), Marivate (2014), Worku (2015) and Khale (2015). The authors have reported that small, micro and medium-sized enterprises (SMMEs) often fail due to poor or inadequate municipal services, over-regulation, unnecessary bureaucratic procedures, lack of transparency, lack of good governance, lack of efficiency in the administration and management of license applications, inability to assess and evaluate tax, lack of entrepreneurial skills, lack of accounting and auditing and bookkeeping skills, inability to draw up business plans, inability to make oral presentations, inability to network with business rivals and competitors, difficulty in securing loans from commercial banks and micro-lending financial institutions and lack of infrastructure.

### III. METHODS AND MATERIALS OF STUDY

The design of study was cross-sectional and descriptive. Data was collected from 181 employees of the City of Tshwane by using a structured questionnaire of study. Purposive sampling was used for selecting eligible respondents working for the City of Tshwane in various Departments. Quantitative data analyses were performed by using frequency tables, cross-tab analyses, factor analysis (Hair, Black, Babin & Anderson, 2010) and logit analysis (Hosmer & Lemeshow, 2013).

#### Results of study

Table 1 shows the general characteristics of the 188 respondents who took part in the study. The table shows that 49% of respondents have had past training opportunities. The percentage of employees with satisfactory performance was equal to 52%. It can be seen from the table that 60% of respondents have matric level academic qualifications. The percentage of respondents with degree level qualifications is only 14%. The table shows that 60% of residents rent property. The table shows that 61% of respondents earn salaries of 10, 000 Rand or less. It can be seen from the table that respondents who took part in the study are characterized by low level of skills, low level of formal education, and lack of expertise in areas that require advanced operational competence in municipal service delivery.

**Table 1: General characteristics of respondents (n=188)**

Characteristics of respondents	Frequency and percentage
Past training opportunity	Yes: 98 (52%) No: 90 (48%)
Performance in most recent quarter	Adequate: 68 (52%) Inadequate: 63 (48%)
Job satisfaction	Satisfied: 79 (60%) Not satisfied: 52 (40%)
Highest level of education	Matric or below: 71 (54%) Certificate or diploma: 30 (23%) Bachelor's degree: 22 (17%) Master's degree: 4 (3%) Doctorate or more: 4 (3%)
Gender	Male: 68 (52%) Female: 63 (48%)
Age category	20 years or less: 4 (3%) 21 to 30 years: 33 (25%) 31 to 40 years: 49 (37%) 41 to 50 years: 35 (27%) 51 years or more: 10 (8%)
Duration of service	Less than 5 years: 16 (12%) 5 to 10 years: 34 (26%) 11 to 20 years: 29 (22%) 21 or more: 52 (40%)
Race	Black or African: 116 (89%) White: 8 (6%) Coloured: 5 (4%) Asian: 2 (2%)
Marital status	Single: 56 (43%) Married: 42 (32%) Divorced: 5 (4%) Windowed: 4 (3%) Others: 24 (18%)
Perception of low salary	Yes: 62 (47%) No: 69 (53%)
Perception of lack of appreciation	Yes: 29 (22%) No: 102 (78%)
Perception of poor career development	Yes: 31 (24%) No: 100 (76%)
Perception of low salary	Yes: 42 (32%) No: 89 (68%)
Perception of lack of incentives	Yes: 51 (39%) No: 80 (61%)
Negative perception of performance evaluation	Yes: 47 (36%) No: 84 (64%)

Table 2 shows results obtained from cross-tab analyses. At the 5% level of significance, the results show that inadequate performance is significantly associated with lack of training opportunities, low level of formal education, lack of job satisfaction, lack of performance monitoring and evaluation, short duration of employment, perception of low salary, perception of poor employee benefits, perception of poor career development, perception of lack of incentives for employees, and perception of lack of appreciation from customers, in a decreasing order of strength.

**Table 2: Results obtained from Pearson's Chi-square tests of associations (n=188)**

Inadequate performance	Observed Pearson chi-square value	P-value
Lack of training opportunities	16.9754	0.000***
Low level of formal education	16.2946	0.000***
Lack of job satisfaction	16.0558	0.000***
Lack of performance monitoring and evaluation	14.3888	0.000***
Short duration of employment	13.4939	0.000***
Perception of low salary	13.3229	0.001**
Perception of poor employee benefits	13.3229	0.002**
Perception of poor career development	11.3609	0.004**
Perception of lack of incentives for employees	11.3295	0.007**
Perception of lack of appreciation from customers	10.9430	0.017*

Legend: Significance levels at \* P<0.05; \*\* P<0.01; \*\*\* P<0.001

**Results obtained from logit analysis**

Table 3 shows results obtained from logit analysis. At the 5% level of significance, the results show that inadequate performance is significantly associated with lack of training opportunities, low level of formal education, and lack of job satisfaction, in a decreasing order of strength.

**Table 3: Results obtained from logit analysis (n=131)**

Factors that affect inadequate performance	Odds Ratio	95% C. I.	P-value
Lack of training opportunities	6.80	(4.87, 8.36)	0.000
Low level of formal education	4.12	(2.89, 6.02)	0.000
Lack of job satisfaction	3.76	(2.28, 5.69)	0.000

The odds ratio of the variable lack of training opportunities is equal to 6.80. This indicates that an employee who is not trained on the job is 6.80 times as likely to underperform in comparison with another employee who is trained on the job. The odds ratio of the variable low level of formal education is equal to 4.12. This indicates that an employee who has a low level of education (matric level or less) is 4.12 times as likely to underperform in comparison with another employee whose level of formal education is high (above matric level). The odds ratio of the variable low level of job satisfaction is equal to 3.76. This indicates that an employee who has no job satisfaction is 3.76 times as likely to underperform in comparison with another employee who has job satisfaction.

**IV. RESULTS OBTAINED FROM FACTOR ANALYSIS**

Factor analysis (Field, 2010:134) was used for identifying and quantifying key predictors of inadequate performance among employees. The following procedures were followed while performing factor analysis (Computation of the correlation matrix for all variables, Extraction of initial factors, and Rotation of the extracted factors as a terminal solution). Factor analysis produced 3 influential predictor variables that influenced inadequate performance by employees. Factor analysis is useful in cases where the correlation among the variables of study is significant. The correlation matrix in this study showed that several pairs of variables had correlations exceeding 0.3, thereby showing that factor analysis was appropriate. In this study, a cutoff point of 0.3 was used as is recommended by Field (2010:138). The Cronbach Alpha test for internal consistency was used for testing the suitability of the 29-item structured questionnaire of study. The test gave a value of 0.881 and an associated level of significance that was smaller than 0.001. Furthermore, Bartlett's test of Sphericity was used for testing the adequacy of the correlation matrix, and gave an estimate of 0.848, a figure that was greater than the cut-off point of 0.5, thereby confirming the suitability of factor analysis.

**Table 4: Estimates obtained from the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin and Bartlett's test**

<b>Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) measure of sampling adequacy</b>	<b>0.848</b>
Observed value of chi-square statistic for KMO test	1108.07
Bartlett's Test of sphericity degrees of freedom	248
P-value for Bartlett's Test of sphericity degrees of freedom	0.000

Table 5 shows the total variance explained by the top 3 influential variables of study.

**Table 5: Results estimated from factor analysis**

Factors that affect inadequate performance	Eigen value	Percentage of explained variance in viability	Cumulative percentage of explained variance
Lack of training opportunities	5.119	39.159	39.159
Low level of formal education	4.708	27.308	66.467
Lack of job satisfaction	3.619	13.650	80.117

The results shown in Table 5 provide estimates for the percentage of variance explained by the 3 factors that were extracted by using the principal axis factoring method. Each of the 3 extracted factors has an Eigen value of magnitude greater than 1, thereby indicating its level of importance in terms of accounting for viability in business. The 3 extracted factors collectively account for 80.117% of the total variability in viability (the dependent variable of study). Based on the estimates shown in Table 5 above, it can be concluded that inadequate performance is significantly associated with lack of training opportunities, low level of formal education, and lack of job satisfaction, in a decreasing order of strength. The 3 factors listed above accounted for 80.117% of total variability. This figure is above 75%.



**Summary of key results obtained from in-depth interviews**

The key findings obtained from in-depth interviews conducted with 12 employees of the City of Tshwane could be summarised as follows:

- Providing training opportunities to employees on a regular basis is vital, and needs to be adequately planned, resourced and funded so that all employees could benefit from such training programmes.
- Training programmes must be modelled after key performance areas and key performance indicators as a means of saving valuable resources and time.
- Promotion opportunities must not be given to employees who fail to improve their performance after taking a training opportunity.
- A comprehensive performance monitoring and evaluation programme must be implemented with a view to identify the training needs and priorities of employees.
- All sorts of complaints made by customers on poor service delivery must be duly investigated by suitably qualified and independently appointed bodies in order to address performance-related problems promptly and efficiently.
- Employees who had a training opportunity were relatively more productive and better motivated at work in comparison with employees who did not have training opportunities. Training and development opportunities provided to employees by the City of Tshwane were not aligned to the skills needed for performing Key Performance Areas (KPAs). Although the municipality continues to provide training via its respective departments, its training academy and external service providers, there is rampant service delivery protests in City of Tshwane particularly in the townships.
- The evaluation of performance of employees was plagued by the perception of racism, partisanship and political interference.
- There was an acute shortage of adequately trained experts in key areas of service delivery. Although the City of Tshwane has initiated internship and learnership programs that are aimed at offering training and development programmes, such efforts were not implemented vigorously.
- Performance monitoring and evaluation was not done in the context of seeking to improve service delivery but to increase salaries and determine whether bonuses could be awarded.
- There was insufficient follow-up after training and development programs to determine if the performance of trainees has improved significantly.
- Regionalisation was hampered by lack of trained, suitably qualified and dedicated personnel.

**Key findings of study**

The study has shown that inadequate performance is significantly associated with lack of training opportunities, low level of formal education, and lack of job satisfaction, in a decreasing order of strength. Results obtained from in-depth interviews have also shown that the City of Tshwane lacks effective monitoring and following up systems for training and development. Training and development programmes need to be aligned to the key performance areas of employees. The City of Tshwane is characterized by erratic and inept approaches to training and development which result in the absence of accountability and necessary resources for ensuring employees are given power to and adequately prepared to deal with the service delivery challenges. There is a need for a strategic, well-planned, needs-based, outcomes-based and competency-based approach to training and development which is closely linked to the expected performance of municipal employees as stated in the IDP and allied policy documents.

**Recommendations of study**

Based on findings obtained from the study, it is recommended to the City of Tshwane to develop and implement a comprehensive performance monitoring and evaluation programme as a means of ensuring adequate performance and service delivery by all employees of the City of Tshwane. It is strategically beneficial for the City of Tshwane to provide employees with career growth paths and development programmes. Tailor-made and skills based training opportunities should be provided to employees as a means of providing them with incentives and motivation at work. The training programmes must be aligned with the operational and business needs and requirements of customers of the City of Tshwane. The City of Tshwane should forge strategic partnerships and collaborations with key stakeholders such as research and academic institutions with a view to acquire suitable training and development programmes.

## LIST OF REFERENCES

- [1]. AGUINIS, H. & KRAIGER, K. 2009. Benefits of training and development for individuals and teams, organizations, and society. *Annual review of psychology*, 60(1): 451-474.
- [2]. AIGBAVBOA, C. & THWALA, W. 2013. Residents' perception of subsidised low-income housing in South Africa: a case study of Kliptown, Johannesburg. *J Hum Ecol*, 42(1): 17-23.
- [3]. ALEGRE, H., TUHOVCAK, L. & VRBKOVA, P. 2004. Performance management and historical analysis: the use of the CARE-W PI Tool by the Brno Waterworks Municipality. *Water Intelligence Online*, 3(5): 2-5.
- [4]. ARAGON-SANCHEZ, A., BARBA-ARAGÓN, I. & SANZ-VALLE, R. 2003. Effects of training on business results. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 14(6): 956-980.
- [5]. ASAH, F., FATOKI, O. O. & RUNGANI, E. 2015. The impact of motivations, personal values and management skills on the performance of SMEs in South Africa. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 6(3): 308-322.
- [6]. BARNOW, B. S. 2000. Exploring the relationship between performance management and program impact: A case study of the Job Training Partnership Act. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 19(1): 118-141.
- [7]. BEZUIDENHOUT A. & NENUNGWI, A. L. 2012. A competency framework for the small business sector in Johannesburg, South Africa. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(47): 11658-11669.
- [8]. BOOYSENS, I. 2011. Are small, medium- and micro-sized enterprises engines of innovation? The reality in South Africa. *Science and Public Policy*, 38(1): 67-78.
- [9]. BROWNE, W. J. & GOLDSTEIN, H. 2010. MCMC sampling for a Multilevel model with non-independent residuals within and between cluster units. *Journal of Educational and Behavioural Statistics*, 35(1): 453-473.
- [10]. BREETZKE, G. D. & HORN, A. C. 2006. Crossing the racial divide: a spatial-ecological perspective of offenders in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality, South Africa. *GeoJournal*, 67(3): 181-194.
- [11]. BROWNSON, C. D. 2014. Does constituent of entrepreneurial culture differ in individuals?
- [12]. *International Journal of Small Business and Entrepreneurship Research*, 2(2): 22-27.
- [13]. CAMERON, R. 2005. Metropolitan restructuring (and more restructuring) in South Africa. *Public Administration and Development*, 25(4): 329-339.
- [14]. CAMERON, R. & SEWELL, B. 2003. The implementation of performance management in the Cape Town Municipality: 1996-2000. *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, 6(2): 243-261.
- [15]. DE WAAL, A. & GERRITSEN-MEDEMA, G. 2006. Performance management analysis: A case study at a Dutch municipality. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, 55(1): 26-39.
- [16]. DIEDERICKS, D. & JOUBERT, J. 2006. *Towards transportation system integration in the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality*. Pretoria: City of Tshwane.
- [17]. DIERDORFF, E. C. & SURFACE, E. A. 2007. Assessing training needs: do work experience and capability matter? *Human performance*, 21(1): 28-48.
- [18]. EDOHO, F. M. 2015. Entrepreneurialism: Africa in transition. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, 6(2): 127-147.
- [19].
- [20]. HAIR, J. F., BLACK, W. C., BABIN, B. J. & ANDERSON, R. E. 2010. *Multivariate Data Analysis: A Global Perspective*. London: Pearson.
- [21]. HENREKSON, M. 2014. Entrepreneurship, innovation, and human flourishing. *Small Business Economics*, 43(3): 511-528.
- [22]. HOSMER, D. W. & LEMESHOW, S. 2013. *Applied Logistic Regression Analysis*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- [23]. GOLAM-HOSSAN, C. 2007. Employee Training and Development. *Management Research News*, 30(12): 955-956.
- [24]. HAIR, J. F., BLACK, W. C., BABIN, B. J. & ANDERSON, R. E. 2010. Multivariate Data
- [25]. Analysis: A Global Perspective. London: Pearson.
- [26]. HENREKSON, M. 2014. Entrepreneurship, innovation, and human flourishing. Small
- [27]. Business Economics, 43(3): 511-528.
- [28]. HORN, A. 2010. Telling Stories-A History of Growth Management in the Gauteng Province (South Africa). *European Spatial Research and Policy*, 17(2): 41-54.
- [29]. HOSMER, D. W. & LEMESHOW, S. 2013. *Applied Logistic Regression Analysis*. New
- [30]. York: John Wiley & Sons.

- [31]. KHALE, S. 2015. Assessment of the quality of municipal services in the City of Tshwane, South Africa. *Journal of Corporate Ownership and Control*, 13(1): 678-695.
- [32]. LADZANI, W. M. & NETSWERA, G. F. 2009. Support for rural Small Businesses in Tshwane, South Africa. *Development Southern Africa*, 26(2): 14-21.
- [33]. MAFUNISA, M. 2004. Measuring efficiency and effectiveness in local government in South Africa. *Journal of public Administration*, 39(2): 290-301.
- [34]. MARIVATE, S. P. 2014. The impact of entrepreneurial skills on the viability and longterm survival of small businesses: a case of the city of Tshwane, South Africa. *European Journal of Business, Economics and Accountancy*, 2(2): 53-72.
- [35]. MCNAMARA, C. 2008. *Employee training and development: reasons and benefits*. [Online]. Available from: [http://managementhelp.org/trng\\_dev/basics/reasons.htm](http://managementhelp.org/trng_dev/basics/reasons.htm) [Accessed: 17 May 2016].
- [36]. NEL, E. & ROGERSON, C. 2005. Pro-Poor Local Economic Development in South Africa's Cities. *Africa Insight*, 35(4): 2-15.
- [37]. PHAGO, K. 2009. Integrated Development Plan (IDP) in South African local government: the case of the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality. *Journal of public Administration*, 44(3): 483-491.
- [38]. SANDERSON, I. 2001. Performance management, evaluation and learning in 'modern' local government. *Public Administration*, 79(2): 297-313.
- [39]. SEELETSE, S. M. 2012. Common causes of small businesses failure in the townships of West Rand district municipality in the Gauteng Province of South Africa. *African Journal of Business Management*, 6(44): 10994-11002.
- [40]. SHREE, S. & URBAN, B. 2012. Internationalisation of South African SMEs: The role of capital factors. *Acta Commercii*, 12(1): 186-199.
- [41]. SNYMAN, J. & VORSTER, K. 2011. Towards zero waste: a case study in the City of Tshwane. *Waste Management & Research*, 29(5): 512-520.
- [42]. SOUTH AFRICAN CHAMBER OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY. 2016. *Business confidence index – Press release* [Online]. Available from: <http://www.sacci.org.za/> [Accessed: 17 May 2016].
- [43]. SOUTH AFRICAN NATIONAL DEPARTMENT OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY. 2013. *SMME Development* [Online]. Available from: <http://www.thedti.gov.za/> [Accessed: 17 May 2016].
- [44]. SOUTH AFRICAN SMALL ENTERPRISE DEVELOPMENT AGENCY (SEDA). 2013. *SAIE learning loop: Why the loop?* [Online]. Available from: <http://www.entrepreneurship.co.za/> [Accessed: 17 May 2016].
- [45]. STATA CORPORATION. 2012. *User's Guide for STATA version 13*. College Station, Texas, USA: STATA Corporation.
- [46]. VERBEETEN, F. H. 2008. Performance management practices in public sector organizations: impact on performance. *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 21(3): 427-454.
- [47]. WORKU, Z. 2015. Predictors of incubation of small, micro and medium-sized businesses in Gauteng province, South Africa. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 13(1): 7-17.